

DELEGATED

**AGENDA NO
PLANNING COMMITTEE**

15th January 2020

**REPORT OF DIRECTOR,
ECONOMIC GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT**

19/2053/FUL

7 Marquis Grove, Norton, TS20 1QQ

Erection of two storey extension to the side to include installation of flue and single storey extension to the rear (demolition of existing garage)

Expiry Date 11th November 2019

SUMMARY

The application site is a detached dwelling located at the head of the cul-de-sac along Marquis Grove, Norton. The surrounding properties on Marquis Grove are predominately 2 storey dwellings, the majority of which date from circa 1970 although there are a few which are more recently constructed.

This application seeks planning permission for the erection of a two storey side extension and single storey extension to the rear.

Seven support comments have been received commenting that the design is in keeping with the property and street scene, does not impact on neighbouring properties and will improve the house and family living space.

The main planning considerations with regard to this application are the impacts on the existing dwelling and street scene, and the impact on the amenity of neighbouring properties.

The application seeks to demolish the existing attached flat roof garage and replace with a two storey side extension. Whilst the extension is set back from the principle elevation and offers a slight reduction to the overall ridge height, it results in a significant amount of additional bulk being added to the side of the existing dwelling. This combined with the increased extent of the dwellings frontage and the proximity to the boundary of the plot mean that the extension would appear as a dominant and incongruous feature within the street scene and adversely affect the character of the surrounding area.

For the avoidance of doubt, it is not that a two storey extension is an inappropriate form of development for the plot, it is about the scale of development currently proposed. Officers have advised the applicant of what would be considered more appropriate, but the applicant has requested the proposal be considered as submitted.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning application 19/2053/FUL be refused for the following reason;

Out of character with property and street scene

- 01 In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority, it is considered that the proposed two storey extension to the side by virtue of the scale, design and siting, would be out of keeping with the proportions of the main dwelling house, introducing a dominant and incongruous feature into the street scene to the detriment of the character and appearance of the property and the street scene, contrary to guidance contained**

within paragraph 127 and 130 of the NPPF, Supplementary Planning Guidance Note 2 (Householder Extensions) and Local Planning Policies SD3 and SD8.

SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

1. The application site is a detached dwelling located at the head of the cul-de-sac along Marquis Grove, Norton. The surrounding properties on Marquis Grove are predominately 2 storey dwellings, the majority of which date from circa 1970 although there are a few which are more recently constructed. In addition, the Corby Lodge apartment building on the corner of Junction Road and Marquis Grove.
2. To the north of the site are Lynmouth Road Flats, to the east are no's 44-50 Countisbury Road, to the south west 6 Marquis Grove and to the west is 6A Marquis Grove. To the south the main road serving the property with Junction Road beyond.

PROPOSAL

3. The application seeks planning permission for a two storey extension to the side, which would include a garage, utility and family room at ground floor (including a wood burning stove), with a separate stair case serving an independent first floor with 'galleried' space over the family room. The extension has an approximate width of 9.1 metres, a length of approximately 9.8 metres and projects beyond the rear wall of the property by approximately 5.2 metres.
4. A single storey extension also projects from the rear wall by 5.1 metre with a width of 3.7 metre and ties into the two storey extension. Within the north and east elevation are bi-folding doors. The extension has an approximate eaves height of 2.7 metres and a hipped roof with an overall height of 4 metres.

CONSULTATIONS

5. The following Consultations were notified and any comments received are set out below:-

Standard Advice Highways Transport & Design Manager

No objections, subject to any increase in parking provision being met in accordance with the Councils adopted Supplementary Planning Document SPD3.

Environmental Health Unit

I have no objection in principle to the development, subject to the imposition of the following advisory condition:

Construction/ Demolition Noise

I am concerned about the short-term environmental impact on the surrounding dwellings during construction/demolition, should the development be approved. My main concerns are potential noise, vibration and dust emissions from site operations and vehicles accessing the site. I would recommend working hours for all Construction/Demolition operations including delivery/removal of materials on/off site be restricted to 08:00 - 18:00Hrs on weekdays, 09:00 - 13:00Hrs on a Saturday and no Sunday or Bank Holiday working.

Position of the Flue

I have assessed the drawings for the proposed development and I am happy with the positioning of the flue.

PUBLICITY

6. Neighbours were notified and seven support comments were received from the following addresses with the content summarised below.

Supporting comments

- Consider that the design is in keeping with the property and street scene

- Does not impact on neighbouring properties
- Will improve the house and family living space

1. Mr And Mrs Cox 6A Marquis Grove Norton
2. Vicky Moseley 10 Lynmouth Road Norton
3. Joanne Havert 48 Countisbury Road Norton
4. Mr And Mrs M Gilhooley 6 Marquis Grove Norton
5. Daniel McDowall 8 Marquis Grove Norton
6. Owner/Occupier 4 Marquis Grove Norton
7. J R M Turner 5 Marquis Grove Norton

PLANNING POLICY

7. Where an adopted or approved development plan contains relevant policies, Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that an application for planning permissions shall be determined in accordance with the Development Plan(s) for the area, unless material considerations indicate otherwise. In this case the relevant Development Plan is the Stockton on Tees Borough Council Local Plan 2019.
8. Section 143 of the Localism Act came into force on the 15 January 2012 and requires the Local Planning Authority to take local finance considerations into account, this section s70(2) Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended requires in dealing with such an application the authority shall have regard to a) the provisions of the development plan, so far as material to the application, b) any local finance considerations, so far as material to the application and c) any other material considerations.

National Planning Policy Framework

9. The purpose of the planning system is to contribute to the achievement of sustainable development. Achieving sustainable development means that the planning system has three overarching objectives, which are interdependent and need to be pursued in mutually supportive ways. These are economic social and environmental objectives.
10. So that sustainable development is pursued in a positive way, at the heart of the Framework is a presumption in favour of sustainable development (paragraph 11) which for decision making means;
 - approving development proposals that accord with an up-to-date development plan without delay; or
 - where there are no relevant development plan policies, or the policies which are most important for determining the application are out-of-date, granting permission unless:
 - i. the application of policies in this Framework that protect areas or assets of particular importance provides a clear reason for refusing the development proposed; or
 - ii. any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in this Framework taken as a whole.
11. It is also considered that the following paragraphs of the NPPF are relevant to the determination of the application;

Paragraph 127 - promoting good design, ensuring that developments add to the overall quality of the area, are visually attractive, sympathetic to local character and maintain a strong sense of place.

Paragraph 130 - Permission should be refused for development of poor design that fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality of an area

Local Planning Policy

12. The following planning policies are considered to be relevant to the consideration of this application.

Policy SD1 - Presumption in favour of Sustainable Development

1. In accordance with the Government's National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), when the Council considers development proposals it will take a positive approach that reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained in the NPPF. It will always work proactively with applicants jointly to find solutions which mean that proposals for sustainable development can be approved wherever possible, and to secure development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions in the area.
2. Planning applications that accord with the policies in this Local Plan (and, where relevant, with policies in neighbourhood plans) will be approved without delay, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Strategic Development Strategy Policy 3 (SD3) - Housing Strategy

7. Proposals for all domestic extensions will be supported where they are in keeping with the property and the street scene in terms of style, proportion and materials, and avoid significant loss of privacy and amenity for the residents of neighbouring properties.

Strategic Development Strategy Policy 8 (SD8) - Sustainable Design Principles

1. The Council will seek new development to be designed to the highest possible standard, taking into consideration the context of the surrounding area and the need to respond positively to the:
 - a. Quality, character and sensitivity of the surrounding public realm, heritage assets, and nearby buildings, in particular at prominent junctions, main roads and town centre gateways;
 - e. Privacy and amenity of all existing and future occupants of land and buildings;
2. New development should contribute positively to making places better for people. They should be inclusive and establish a strong sense of place, using streetscapes and buildings to create attractive and comfortable places to live, work and visit.

MATERIAL PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

13. The main planning considerations of this application are the impacts upon character of the area, amenity of neighbouring residents and highway safety.

Character

14. The policies of both the NPPF and the Local Plan encourage high standards of design. As set out within paragraph 127 of the NPPF and Planning Policies SD3 and SD8, new development should be appropriate to the context of the surrounding area, make a positive contribution and be of an appropriate style, proportion and materials to the main dwelling.
15. The Marquis Grove is a no through road and is predominately a 1970's development consisting of large detached dwellings. Although there are recent additional dwellings situated in the rear gardens which include 6A, 9 and 10 Marquis Grove, it is the 1970's developments which form the main basis for the character of the street scene.
16. The host dwelling is located at the head of the cul-de-sac, as a result it is considered to be in a highly visible position and can be seen on entering Marquis Grove. The existing dwelling (excluding the single storey double garage) current reflects the scale and character of those 1970's properties on Marquis Grove at a width of approximately 13 metres, (the attached double garage with a width of approximately 6 metres).

17. The application seeks to demolish the existing attached flat roof garage and replace with a two storey side extension. The proposed two storey side extension measures 9.1m wide increasing the overall width of the property from 19m to 22.3m and would bring the extension within 0.9m of the western boundary.
18. Whilst the extension is set back from the principle elevation and offers a slight reduction to the overall ridge height, it results in a significant amount of additional bulk being added to the side of the existing dwelling, this combined with the increased extent of the dwellings frontage and the proximity to the boundary of the plot mean that it is not in keeping with the overall scale and proportion of the existing dwelling. The extension would therefore appear as a dominant and incongruous feature within the street scene and adversely affect the character of the surrounding area.
19. For the avoidance of doubt, it is not that a two storey extension is an inappropriate form of development for the plot, it is about the scale of development currently proposed. Officers have advised the applicant that they would consider a two-storey extension of a similar width to the existing double garage (i.e. 6m) to be more appropriate for the scale of the property, plot and street scene. The applicant has declined this option and requested the proposal be considered as submitted.
20. The single storey extension to the rear which would not be visible from the main road serving the property is not considered to result in a harmful impact upon the character and appearance of the host dwelling or the surrounding area.

Amenity

21. The proposed two storey extension to the side would include first floor windows and roof lights to the front and rear serving a galleried seating area and at ground floor a garage within the front elevation and rear facing windows serving a family room. The front facing windows would not result in any direct overlooking and at the rear of the property, there is in excess of 21 metres to the nearest habitable room windows and are heavily screened by the existing boundary planting within the rear garden area of the host dwelling. The extension will therefore not have any implications on privacy.
22. 6A Marquis Grove is located to the west of the application site and is located on a slightly lower ground level. The proposed development does not include any side elevation windows that would overlook this property. This property is an L-shape and benefits from a room above the garage. The relationship between the two properties would not result of direct overlooking and whilst the extension proposes to be within one metre of the shared boundary as the extension does not project further forward and given the orientation it is not considered to result in a significant overbearing or overshadowing impact.
23. 10 Marquis Grove is located to the south west of the host dwelling and offers a front to side relationship. There is an existing ground floor side extension with high level window. Due to the separation distance and the orientation of the properties is it not considered that the extension would result in an overbearing or overshadowing impact upon this property.
24. Along the eastern boundary are 44, 46 and 48 Countisbury Road, the rear elevations of these properties overlook the rear garden area of the host dwelling. It was noted on site 48 Countisbury Road has previously been extended and there is an existing overlooking relationship between the properties. The two storey extension to the side would be sited approximately 9 metres from the shared boundary and includes no side elevation windows that would overlook this property, the existing situation is therefore not considered to be significantly worsened. Additionally the relationship is a side to rear and offers more than 11 metres separation distance from the main habitable room windows at the property. The ground floor

side elevation bi-fold doors are partially screened by the existing fence and planting at the property and would not result in an adverse impact upon the amenity area enjoyed at these properties or have a significant overbearing or overshadowing impact.

Highway safety

25. The proposed development does not increase the number of bedrooms or reduce the amount of incurtilage car parking spaces at the property. The Highway Transport and Design Manager therefore offers no objections to the proposed development and it is not considered to pose a risk to highway safety.

Other matters

26. The Council's Environmental Health have been consulted and raise no objections to the positioning of the flue.

CONCLUSION

27. In view of the above considerations it is considered that the scale and design of the proposed two storey extension is inappropriate for the property and street scene. The extension would therefore appear as a dominant and incongruous feature within the street scene and adversely affect the character of the surrounding area. It is therefore recommended that the application be refused for the reason specified in the report above.

Director of Economic Growth and Development

Contact Officer Jade Harbottle Telephone No 01642 528716

WARD AND WARD COUNCILLORS

| | |
|------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Ward | Norton West |
| Ward Councillor | Councillor Tony Riordan |
| Ward Councillor | Councillor Hilary Vickers |

IMPLICATIONS

Human Rights Implications:

The provisions of the European Convention of Human Rights 1950 have been taken into account in the preparation of this report.

Community Safety Implications:

The provisions of Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 have been taken into account in the preparation of this report

Background Papers

Stockton on Tees Local Plan Adopted 2019

Supplementary Planning Guidance - Householder Extensions